

General Docket
United States Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit

Court of Appeals Docket #: 17-30999

Docketed: 12/27/2017

Termed: 12/20/2018

Nature of Suit: 2895 Freedom of Information Act

Michael Gahagan v. US Citizenship & Img Services, et al

Appeal From: Eastern District of Louisiana, New Orleans

Fee Status: Fee Paid

Case Type Information:

- 1) United States Civil
- 2) United States
- 3)

Originating Court Information:

District: 053L-2 : [2:15-CV-6218](#)

Originating Judge: Jay C. Zainey, U.S. District Judge

Date Filed: 11/22/2015

Date NOA Filed:

12/23/2017

Date Rec'd COA:

12/23/2017

Prior Cases:

None

Current Cases:

	Lead	Member	Start	End
Consolidated				
	17-30898	17-30901	12/05/2017	
	17-30898	17-30999	01/12/2018	
Related				
	17-30999	17-30901	01/09/2018	

Panel Assignment:**Panel:** WED GJC ASO**Date of Hearing:** 11/06/2018**Date of Decision:** 12/20/2018**Date Completed:** 12/20/2018

MICHAEL W. GAHAGAN
Plaintiff - Appellant

Mahesha P. Subbaraman, Attorney
Direct: 612-315-9210
Email: mps@subblaw.com
Fax: 612-315-9210
[COR LD NTC Retained]
Subbaraman, P.L.L.C.
Suite 1600
222 S. 9th Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402-3389

Michael Wayne Gahagan, Esq.
Direct: 504-931-5355
Email: michaelgahagan@immigrationlawneworleans.com
Fax: 504-836-0070
[NTC Pro Se]
Immigration Law Firm of New Orleans
Suite 524
3445 N. Causeway Boulevard
Metairie, LA 70002

v.

UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP & IMMIGRATION
SERVICES
Defendant - Appellee

Brock Darren Dupre, Assistant U.S. Attorney
Direct: 504-680-3000
Email: brock.dupre@usdoj.gov
Fax: 504-589-4661
[COR LD NTC Government]
U.S. Attorney's Office
Eastern District of Louisiana
Suite 1600
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130

Kevin G. Boitmann, Assistant U.S. Attorney
Direct: 504-680-3000
Email: kevin.boitmann@usdoj.gov
Fax: 504-589-4661
[COR NTC Government]
U.S. Attorney's Office
Eastern District of Louisiana
Suite 1600
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130

Peter M. Mansfield, Assistant U.S. Attorney
Direct: 504-680-3000
Email: peter.mansfield@usdoj.gov
[COR NTC Government]
U.S. Attorney's Office
Eastern District of Louisiana
Suite 1600
650 Poydras Street
New Orleans, LA 70130

U.S. CUSTOMS & BORDER PROTECTION
Defendant - Appellee

Brock Darren Dupre, Assistant U.S. Attorney
Direct: 504-680-3000
[COR LD NTC Government]
(see above)

Kevin G. Boitmann, Assistant U.S. Attorney
Direct: 504-680-3000
[COR NTC Government]
(see above)

Peter M. Mansfield, Assistant U.S. Attorney
Direct: 504-680-3000
[COR NTC Government]
(see above)










MICHAEL W. GAHAGAN,




Plaintiff - Appellant







v.

UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP & IMMIGRATION SERVICES; U.S. CUSTOMS & BORDER PROTECTION,

Defendants - Appellees

12/27/2017	 2 pg, 90.22 KB	US CIVIL CASE docketed. NOA filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan [17-30999] (RLL) [Entered: 12/27/2017 09:18 AM]
01/05/2018	 3 pg, 326.18 KB	APPEARANCE FORM <i>Mahesha P. Subbaraman</i> for the court's review. Lead Counsel? Yes. [17-30999] (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 01/05/2018 02:37 PM]
01/09/2018		APPEARANCE FORM FILED by Attorney Mahesha P. Subbaraman for Appellant Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30999 [17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 01/09/2018 09:47 AM]
01/10/2018	 2 pg, 140.81 KB	INITIAL CASE CHECK by Attorney Advisor complete, Action: Case OK to Process. [8676267-2] Initial AA Check Due satisfied. [17-30999] (RLL) [Entered: 01/10/2018 08:24 AM]
01/10/2018		ELECTRONIC RECORD ON APPEAL REQUESTED FROM DISTRICT COURT for 2:15-CV-6218. Electronic ROA due on 01/25/2018. [17-30999] (RLL) [Entered: 01/10/2018 08:28 AM]
01/12/2018	 1 pg, 139.92 KB	CLERK ORDER granting unopposed motion to consolidate case 17-30999, with cases 17-30898 and 17-30901 [8677080-2] ; denying as unnecessary appellant's motion to extend time to file appellant's brief [8677080-3] ; and denying as unnecessary appellant's motion to extend time to file appellee's brief [8677080-4] , filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan, in 17-30898, 17-30901 [8678994-2]. A/Pet's Brief deadline canceled. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (DLJ) [Entered: 01/12/2018 12:35 PM]
01/12/2018	 2 pg, 141.43 KB	LETTER OF ADVISEMENT. Reason: Advising counsel of updated case caption to be used on all future filings in these consolidated cases. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (DLJ) [Entered: 01/12/2018 01:13 PM]
01/26/2018	 3 pg, 78.92 KB	TRANSCRIPT ORDER received advising transcript unnecessary for appeal purposes in consolidated case 17-30999. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: TRANSCRIPT ORDER received from Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999 advising transcript unnecessary for appeal purposes. Date of Service: 01/26/2018, via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 01/26/2018 09:17 AM]
01/29/2018		EXTENSION OF TIME GRANTED to the District Court to prepare the Electronic ROA for 2:15-CV-6218, in case 17-30999, until 02/14/2018. Electronic ROA deadline updated to 02/14/2018, in case 17-30999 ONLY. [17-30999, 17-30898, 17-30901] (DLJ) [Entered: 01/29/2018 02:37 PM]
01/30/2018	 1 pg, 176.85 KB	APPEARANCE FORM received from Mr. Brock Darren Dupre for United States Citizenship & Immigration Services and U.S. Customs & Border Protection in 17-30999 for the court's review. Lead Counsel? Yes. [17-30999, 17-30898, 17-30901] (Brock Darren Dupre) [Entered: 01/30/2018 04:36 PM]
01/30/2018	 1 pg, 166.85 KB	APPEARANCE FORM <i>submitted for Assistant U. S. Attorney Peter M. Mansfield</i> for the court's review. Lead Counsel? No. [17-30999] (Peter M. Mansfield) [Entered: 01/30/2018 04:42 PM]
01/30/2018	 1 pg, 166.88 KB	APPEARANCE FORM <i>submitted for Assistant U. S. Attorney Kevin G. Boitmann</i> for the court's review. Lead Counsel? No. [17-30999] (Kevin G. Boitmann) [Entered: 01/30/2018 04:47 PM]
02/01/2018		APPEARANCE FORM FILED by Attorney Peter M. Mansfield for Appellee United States

018	Citizenship & Immigration Services Appellee U.S. Customs & Border Protection, in case 17-30999 [17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 02/01/2018 12:15 PM]
02/01/2018	APPEARANCE FORM FILED by Attorney Kevin G. Boitmann for Appellee United States Citizenship & Immigration Services Appellee U.S. Customs & Border Protection, in case 17-30999 [17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 02/01/2018 12:17 PM]
02/01/2018	APPEARANCE FORM FILED by Attorney Brock Darren Dupre for Appellee U.S. Customs & Border Protection in 17-30999, Attorney Brock Darren Dupre for Appellee United States Citizenship & Immigration Services in 17-30999 [17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 02/01/2018 02:25 PM]
02/06/2018	ELECTRONIC RECORD ON APPEAL FILED. Exhibits on File in District Court? No. Electronic ROA deadline satisfied. [17-30999] (DDL) [Entered: 02/06/2018 08:34 AM]
02/06/2018	<div style="display: flex; align-items: center;"><div style="margin-right: 10px;"> 3 pg, 132.19 KB</div><div> BRIEFING RESUMED. A/Pet's Brief Due on 02/20/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (DDL) [Entered: 02/06/2018 08:48 AM]</div></div>
02/07/2018	EXTENSION RECEIVED for Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999. Extension Granted to and including 02/27/2018. A/Pet's Brief deadline updated to 02/27/2018, for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (DLJ) [Entered: 02/07/2018 03:12 PM]
02/27/2018	<div style="display: flex; align-items: center;"><div style="margin-right: 10px;"> 0 pg, 0 KB</div><div> APPELLANT'S BRIEF FILED Additionally the Brief requires corrected caption, statement of issues must be double-spaced, certificate of service must be placed in the correct order in the brief, record citations must be corrected where Id is used. Instructions to Attorney: PLEASE READ THE ATTACHED NOTICE FOR INSTRUCTIONS ON HOW TO REMEDY THE DEFAULT. # of Copies Provided: 0 A/Pet's Brief deadline satisfied. Sufficient Brief due on 03/20/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan. Appellee's Brief due on 03/29/2018 for Appellees United States Citizenship & Immigration Services, Executive Office of Immigration Review, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Department of Justice, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement and U.S. Customs & Border Protection [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: APPELLANT'S BRIEF FILED by Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999. Date of service: 02/27/2018 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (WITHDRAWN 3/15/18) (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 02/27/2018 11:29 PM]</div></div>
02/27/2018	<div style="display: flex; align-items: center;"><div style="margin-right: 10px;"> 111 pg, 1.93 MB</div><div> SUFFICIENT RECORD EXCERPTS FILED. # of Copies Provided: 0 Sufficient Record Excerpts deadline satisfied. Paper Copies of Record Excerpts due on 03/19/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: RECORD EXCERPTS FILED. Record Excerpts NOT Sufficient as they require documents included as tabs 13, 14 and 15 are not part of the record and must be removed. Instructions to Attorney: PLEASE READ THE ATTACHED NOTICE FOR INSTRUCTIONS ON HOW TO REMEDY THE DEFAULT. # of Copies Provided: 0 Sufficient Record Excerpts due on 03/20/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: RECORD EXCERPTS FILED by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999. Date of service: 02/27/2018 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 02/27/2018 11:34 PM]</div></div>

03/12/2018	 105 pg, 3.21 MB	UNOPPOSED MOTION for judicial notice [8723899-2], and to file corrected brief [8723899-4]. Date of service: 03/12/2018 [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: UNOPPOSED MOTION filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999 for judicial notice [8723899-2], to allow attachment to brief as a supplement [8723899-3] Attachment included? Yes, to file corrected brief [8723899-4]. Date of service: 03/12/2018 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 03/12/2018 02:10 PM]
03/12/2018	 0 pg, 0 KB	PROPOSED SUFFICIENT RECORD EXCERPTS filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999 [8713888-2] Date of service: 03/12/2018 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 03/12/2018 02:21 PM]
03/15/2018	 1 pg, 136.9 KB	CLERK ORDER granting motion to file corrected brief filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan [8723899-4]; mooted motion for judicial notice filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan [8723899-2] [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 03/15/2018 07:30 AM]
03/15/2018	 82 pg, 1.85 MB	CORRECTED BRIEF filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999 ..Sufficient Brief deadline satisfied. Paper Copies of Brief due on 03/20/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 03/15/2018 07:45 AM]
03/15/2018		COURT ACTION withdrawing Appellant Brief filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan ON 2/27/18. [8713887-2] [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 03/15/2018 07:51 AM]
03/16/2018		Paper copies of Record Excerpts filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999 received. Paper copies match electronic version of document? Yes # of Copies Provided: 4. Paper Copies of Record Excerpts due deadline satisfied. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 03/16/2018 02:42 PM]
03/19/2018		Paper copies of Appellant's Brief filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999 received. Paper copies match electronic version of document? Yes # of Copies Provided: 7. Paper Copies of Brief due deadline satisfied. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 03/20/2018 11:36 AM]
03/29/2018	 44 pg, 285.03 KB	APPELLEE'S BRIEF FILED # of Copies Provided: 0 E/Res's Brief deadline satisfied. Reply Brief due on 04/12/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan. Paper Copies of Brief due on 04/04/2018 for Appellees United States Citizenship & Immigration Services, Executive Office of Immigration Review, United States Department of Homeland Security, United States Department of Justice, United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement and U.S. Customs & Border Protection. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows: APPELLEE'S BRIEF FILED by United States Citizenship & Immigration Services in 17-30898, Executive Office of Immigration Review, DHS, DOJ and ICE in 17-30901, U.S. Customs & Border Protection and United States Citizenship & Immigration Services in 17-30999. Date of service: 03/29/2018 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (Peter M. Mansfield) [Entered: 03/29/2018 05:03 PM]
04/02/2018	 2 pg, 140.42 KB	UNOPPOSED LEVEL 1 EXTENSION REQUESTED by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999 for filing Plaintiff-Appellant Michael W. Gahagan's reply brief until 04/19/2018. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999]

04/02/2018

Paper copies of Appellee Brief filed by Appellee United States Citizenship & Immigration Services, Appellees DHS, DOJ, Executive Office of Immigration Review and ICE, Appellees United States Citizenship & Immigration Services and U.S. Customs & Border Protection in 17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999 received. Paper copies match electronic version of document? Yes # of Copies Provided: 7. Paper Copies of Brief due deadline satisfied. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 04/04/2018 09:35 AM]

04/03/2018

EXTENSION RECEIVED for Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999. Extension Granted to and including 04/19/2018. Reply Brief deadline updated to 04/19/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (AGL) [Entered: 04/03/2018 07:19 AM]

04/19/2018



34 pg, 542.4 KB

APPELLANT'S REPLY BRIEF FILED # of Copies Provided: 0
Reply Brief deadline satisfied. Paper Copies of Brief due on 04/25/2018 for Appellants Michael W. Gahagan and Michael Gahagan. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999]
REVIEWED AND/OR EDITED - The original text prior to review appeared as follows:
APPELLANT'S REPLY BRIEF FILED by Mr. Michael W. Gahagan in 17-30898, Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30901, 17-30999. Date of service: 04/19/2018 via email - Attorney for Appellants: Gahagan, Subbaraman; Attorney for Appellees: Bigelow, Boitmann, Dupre, Mansfield [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (Mahesha P. Subbaraman) [Entered: 04/19/2018 11:35 PM]

04/23/2018

Paper copies of Appellant Reply Brief filed by Appellant Mr. Michael W. Gahagan, Appellant Mr. Michael Gahagan in 17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999 received. Paper copies match electronic version of document? Yes # of Copies Provided: 7. Paper Copies of Brief due deadline satisfied. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (SBS) [Entered: 04/26/2018 10:09 AM]

09/05/2018



2 pg, 155.66 KB

CASE TENTATIVELY calendared for oral argument for the week of 11/05/2018. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (GAM) [Entered: 09/05/2018 03:58 PM]

09/27/2018

CASE CALENDARED for oral argument on Tuesday, 11/06/2018 in New Orleans in the West Courtroom -- AM session. In accordance with our policy, lead counsel only will receive via email at a later date a copy of the court's docket and an acknowledgment form. All other counsel of record should monitor the court's website for the posting of the oral argument calendars.. [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (PFT) [Entered: 09/27/2018 09:12 AM]

10/30/2018



1 pg, 207.31 KB

ORAL ARGUMENT panel has requested of the parties the following: At oral argument, the parties should be prepared to discuss: 1. Whether, under the rule of orderliness, a Supreme Court decision interpreting one statute can unequivocally overrule a Fifth Circuit decision interpreting a different statute. See *Diaz-Esparza v. Sessions*, 697 F. App'x 338, 340 (5th Cir. 2017) (per curiam), cert. granted, judgment vacated, 138 S. Ct. 1986 (2018); *United States v. Alcantar*, 733 F.3d 143, 145 (5th Cir. 2013); *Jacobs v. National Drug Intelligence Center*, 548 F.3d 375, 378 (5th Cir. 2008). 2. Whether the rule of orderliness applies differently to Supreme Court precedent interpreting federal fee-shifting statutes. See *Buckhannon Bd. & Care Home, Inc. v. W. Va. Dep't of Health & Human Res.*, 532 U.S. 598, 603 n.4 (2001); *City of Burlington v. Dague*, 505 U.S. 557, 562 (1992); *Indep. Fed'n of Flight Attendants v. Zipes*, 491 U.S. 754, 758 n.2 (1989); *Hensley v. Eckerhart*, 461 U.S. 424, 433 n.7 (1983). [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (PFT) [Entered: 10/30/2018 11:22 AM]

11/06/2018

ORAL ARGUMENT HEARD before Judges Davis, Costa, Oldham. Arguing Person Information Updated for: Peter M. Mansfield arguing for Appellee United States Citizenship & Immigration Services; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Peter M. Mansfield arguing for Appellee Executive Office of Immigration Review, Appellee United States Department of Homeland Security, Appellee United States Department of Justice; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Peter M. Mansfield arguing for Appellee U.S. Customs & Border Protection; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Mahesha P. Subbaraman arguing for


Appellant Michael W. Gahagan; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Mahesha P. Subbaraman arguing for Appellant Michael Gahagan; Arguing Person Information Updated for: Mahesha P. Subbaraman arguing for Appellant Michael W. Gahagan [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (PFT) [Entered: 11/06/2018 10:54 AM]

12/20/2018  13 pg, 265.75 KB


PUBLISHED OPINION FILED. [17-30898 Affirmed 17-30901 Affirmed 17-30999 Affirmed] Judge: WED , Judge: GJC , Judge: ASO. Mandate issue date is 02/11/2019 [17-30898, 17-30901, 17-30999] (DTG) [Entered: 12/20/2018 04:53 PM]

12/20/2018  1 pg, 37.89 KB

JUDGMENT ENTERED AND FILED. Costs Taxed Against: Appellant. [17-30898] (DTG) [Entered: 12/21/2018 07:42 AM]

12/20/2018  1 pg, 37.53 KB

JUDGMENT ENTERED AND FILED. Costs Taxed Against: Appellant. [17-30901] (DTG) [Entered: 12/21/2018 07:46 AM]

12/20/2018  1 pg, 37.86 KB

JUDGMENT ENTERED AND FILED. Costs Taxed Against: Appellant. [17-30999] (DTG) [Entered: 12/21/2018 07:48 AM]
